



Problems and Solutions in the Implementation of the UNESCO Creative Cities Programme

[Discussants]



Giuseppe BIAGINI
(Founder,
Creative Knowledge
Foundation)



Byung Hoon JEONG
(Focal Point of Jinju City;
Emeritus Professor,
Gyeongsang National
University)



Ronny LOPPIES
(Focal Point of Ambon;
Professor,
Pattimura University)



Witiya PITTUNGNAPOO
(Co-focal Point of Sukhothai;
Associate Professor,
Naresuan University)



Vittorio SALMONI
(Focal Point of Fabriano;
National Coordinator,
Italian Creative Cities)

Introduction

UNESCO proposed the establishment of the Creative Cities Network in 2004. At that time, so-called “globalization” was spreading throughout the world. It was an attempt to unify the economies, societies and cultures of the world according to the standardized criteria of developed countries. UNESCO’s position was that cultures should not be unified. The point is that the creation of new cultures is possible only when various cultures contact, interact, collide and exchange with one another. In short, it is cultural diversity that is at the very foundation of cultural creativity.

UNESCO then proposed to develop various cultural industries based on the cultural assets and creativity of each city and to promote international exchanges and cooperation at the city level. It further proposed creating network of cities all over the world based on mutual recognition and cooperation beyond competition. The result was the creation of the UNESCO Creative Cities Network (UCCN). The UCCN selects new member cities every two years in seven fields such as crafts and folk art, music, design, media arts, literature, film and gastronomy. As of 2022, the UCCN has a total of 295 cities in 93 countries (59 cities in 42 countries in the field of Crafts and Folk Art) in membership.

In 2015, UNESCO announced the UN 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). The UCCN has since been requested by UNESCO to serve as a platform for international cooperation and innovation to achieve the SDGs. UNESCO also recommended UCCN to share knowledge, experiences and practices among creative cities to respond to the global challenges and to build resilience against climate change in the post-COVID-19 pandemic. Furthermore, the UCCN seeks to expand culture’s contribution to the recovery from the COVID-19 pandemic and the role of cultural industries in future development of its member cities through cooperation and collaboration that goes beyond specific creative fields. The UCCN supports the UNESCO’s fundamental values of diversity, solidarity and multilateralism.

Inspired by the fundamental values and missions proposed by UNESCO, many cities around the world seek to join the UCCN. They take culture along

with society, economy and environment as one of the four pillars of urban development. After becoming members, they utilize the UCCN to facilitate international exchanges and share knowledge, experiences and best practices with other members. The member cities also agree that their designation as UNESCO Creative Cities contributes to raising their credit ratings. In addition, they can enhance sustainable development through international cooperation as a member of this worldwide network. Therefore, each city seeks to develop based on their cultural assets and creativity by undertaking international-level projects and local-level programmes which they propose to UNESCO at the time of application for UCCN membership.

In reality, however, the UCCN programme is facing a number of difficulties in realizing UNESCO's values and pursuing sustainable development through culture. First of all, it is not easy to keep city decision-makers engaged in culture and creativity. There are many cases in which ongoing projects are stopped or postponed when city mayors or other parts of governance are replaced or changed. Further, due to lack of funding, it is not unusual to fail in implementing a programme as it was originally planned. The implementation of UNESCO's missions for cultural diversity, social inclusion and reduced inequality is not a simple task. Even if cultural policies and projects led by culture and creativity are adopted, it takes a considerable amount of time for them to foster cultural industries in local areas. It is also not easy to interest local citizens and younger generations to participate in UCCN programmes. It also requires a lot of experience and effort to exchange with other creative cities and expand crosscutting projects or joint initiatives.

How will we pursue sustainable development on the basis of cultural assets and creativity as creative cities while also overcoming these obstacles? The current issue of the Journal presents a number of discussions with a panel of experts from some cities who have a long experience in UCCN activities.

A. General Questions

1. *Creative cities may encounter various problems or difficulties in implementing the UNESCO Creative Cities Network (UCCN) programme—for example, lack of support and cooperation from local governments, obstacles in securing budgets, lack of promotion among citizens, insufficient participation of citizens, and difficulties in fostering cultural industry. What are the most serious issues your city is currently facing, and how are you coping with them?*

Witiya PITTUNGNAPOO: After becoming a member of the UCCN in 2019, Sukhothai has been faced with various challenges. Firstly, there was a lack of continued support due to changes in administrative positions based on political elections which has impacted not only on budget allocation for implementing the UCCN mission, but also international and networking engagement. Therefore, it is important for a focal point to work periodically with newly elected leaders at local government level to achieve mutual understanding and clear communication. Interestingly, the creation of co-focal points led by Naresuan University (Higher Education Institution: HEI in the Lower Northern Region of Thailand) is an initiative and good practice of Sukhothai UCCN that works voluntarily to support the focal point and push Sukhothai UCCN to achieve its targeted sustainable development. The co-focal point of Sukhothai has played significant roles such as integrating HEI missions (teaching, researching, engaging the public and community, and promoting culturally-based activities) and leveraging funding opportunities with the UCCN mission through national and international collaboration.

Ronny LOPPIES: The most serious problem in the development of a creative city in Ambon City of Music is the budgeting system. As a small city, Ambon's limited natural resources greatly affect the city's income. The city's very small income makes it impossible to execute all existing UNESCO Creative Cities Network (UCCN) programmes managed by the Ambon Music

Office (AMO) which have been programmed in 25 strategic steps. Existing budget resources must be distributed among 49 government projects, which already have a long list of priorities. Coupled with the impact of COVID-19, Ambon must trim and reallocate these competing budgets from time to time. The problem becomes even more complicated when the local government's commitment has not focused on placing cultural creativity as a driving force for the movement of cities for future development and using the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) as a list of solutions. Sporadic and partial execution greatly affects existing programmes including budget utilization.

The strategy developed by AMO is to create an innovation programme that is collaborative and has multiple impacts focusing on “Sound” (music) and “Green” (environment) [hereinafter referred to as Sound of Green (SoG)]. SoG is based on the development of music tourism and forest city and refers to the list of solutions for SDG 11. This programme is implemented in collaboration with various target stakeholders. Therefore, the multiplier impact on various sectors from various stakeholders is used as a strong collaborative and coordinating activity to drive and implement the SoG programme because it is also connected with stakeholders who function as budget institutions (aggregators). This relationship is referred to as “hexahelix actors” (academics, business, community, government, media and aggregators).

Giuseppe BIAGINI: 1) Short-term vs Long-term vision: The biggest problem that we have encountered in our collaboration with the UCCs (UNESCO Creative Cities) is the lack of coordination between the local government and the creative community. Many times, this is due not so much to a lack of budget for local projects, but to the different timing and language that a politician, a creative people and a citizen have on describing objectives and measuring results. Politicians tend to have short-term views and often do not want to commit to cultural-based projects. Creatives and citizens want to see short-term results to test the effects and potential of a pilot project and at the same time want long-term continuity on initiatives that offer initial positive results to the community. As such, this dialogue is often very difficult.

2) Bottom-up Approach: The second challenge is to envision projects

that have a bottom-up approach that are, by their own nature, inclusive and open to all the members of the community. Most times even well-thought-out projects do not attract enough participation of that part of the local community that most need to leverage a UNESCO Creative City nomination. It is often the different velocity that the project proposer and the project beneficiaries have in obtaining results that drive the project manager to attract and help those members of the community who already have a success story to tell, instead of guiding people that have nouvelle ideas and are just starting up.

Byung Hoon JEONG: The biggest problem that has been facing our city Jinju is the lack of publicity for citizens. Although three years have already passed since Jinju was designated as a Creative City by UNESCO in 2019, many citizens still do not know this. We have set up billboards along highways around the city that clearly show “Creative City, Jinju” and have placed “UNESCO Creative City” signs on major public facilities including community centers. We have also publicized that programmes organized at the local or international level are those of UNESCO Creative Cities Network (UCCN). Nevertheless, we have noted that many citizens are still unaware of Jinju’s status as a Creative City. Lack of public participation is also pointed out whenever we have an evaluation meeting after each programme. This can be attributed mainly to the fact that people have very few opportunities to get together due to the COVID-19 pandemic since 2020, while most of the programmes were cancelled or discontinued and organized online, instead. We will request cooperation from local media in the future. Event promotion utilizing various social media is also important, considering that people nowadays tend not to pay attention to things unrelated to themselves or their own interests. We will seek ways to deliver leaflets containing information on UCCN programmes directly to every home. We will also try to publish as much news as possible about creative cities in periodicals published by the city. While the administrative and financial support for UCCN programmes in Jinju have been relatively well supported by the local government, I think that it is necessary to establish a long-term plan to foster the cultural industry.

Vittorio SALMONI: As the youngest UNESCO designation, Italian Creative Cities are still struggling to build their standing with administrative and cultural institutions at the national level, which would allow for a greater level of support, funding and project-building.

- 2. The UCCN programme has ideological goals such as cultural rights, cultural diversity, social inclusion, and reduced inequalities. Which of these do you think is the most difficult for your city to achieve through the UCCN programme? What strategies and actions can be taken to effectively address them?*

JEONG: The UCCN is known as a flagship platform to realize the UN 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development Goals and advocates such fundamental values as diversity, solidarity and multilateralism. With its recent focus on social inclusion, it also emphasizes bridging cultural gaps and inequalities among citizens. Jinju is making many efforts to support and realize such values. In addition, our city is trying to introduce cultural policies to promote the cultural rights of citizens which has emerged as an important issue recently. As demonstrated by the theme, “Diversity: Foundation of Creativity,” of the Jinju World Folk Arts Biennale organized by the city this year, we have developed and implemented programmes that realize cultural diversity. In an effort to promote social inclusion and reduce inequality, we are carrying out the “Arts and Culture Delivery” project, according to which arts and culture groups are sent to perform in culturally vulnerable areas. Besides, we are implementing “One Person, One Talent” project to promote people’s cultural rights.

The two problems which we are still having difficulty in addressing are social inclusion and reduced inequality. First of all, as most cultural infrastructures are concentrated in the city center, those in rural areas have difficulty with access. Therefore, it is necessary to establish cultural facilities

with proximity and access for all in mind. This requires considerable funding and a long-term plan. With regard to the issue of gender inequality, there are formidable difficulties to deal with. In Jinju, gender inequality exists in various social and cultural areas. By examining and analyzing cases of other cities around the world that have solved such problems well, we hope to create programmes that are suitable to our city.

LOPPIES: Economic inequality is a major factor and a difficult problem to solve. High economic inequality creates six other gaps: 1) environmental, 2) social, 3) cultural, 4) political, 5) spatial and 6) educational. Ambon is included in the category of cities that have high levels of poverty and unemployment. The gap between the rich and poor is very high as evidenced by the calculation of the Gini coefficient from 2017–2021 of 0.58, 0.57, 0.56, 0.55 and 0.56, respectively. These figures are higher than the national Gini coefficient. The COVID-19 pandemic has increased the poverty rate in Ambon. Quoting data from the Central Statistics Agency (BPS), in 2021, the poverty rate will reach 23,670 people (or 5.02 percent of Ambon's total population of 347,288 people). The impact of the COVID-19 pandemic slowed Ambon's economic growth from 5.78% to -1.95%. Apart from that, the COVID-19 pandemic has also created many difficulties for the Ambon city government in alleviating poverty because the development budget was refocused. Innovating public services is a breakthrough strategy carried out by AMO to overcome the gap in the form of original, new and unique innovations by relying on music as the main locomotive for strengthening the community's creative economy which drives the growth of other sub-sectors. This innovation turned out to be able to encourage community economic growth and employment opportunities because it was rooted in creative ideas and concepts which could survive and adapt during the COVID-19 pandemic. The innovation target is spread over 5 sub-districts focused on 10 Music Tourism Attractions. There was a significant increase in the local music creative industry which leveraged the number of music creative economy actors by 47.8 percent, resulting in an increase of 96.36 percent in non-music creative economy actors (2019–2021).

PITTUNGNAPOO: Sukhothai regards SDG 10 (Reduce Inequalities) as one of its main targets. Therefore, the city aims to reduce inequality while also increasing social inclusion for all regardless of gender, income, age, education or ability. One of Sukhothai UCCN missions is to create learning opportunities for all local crafts-creators and entrepreneurs to develop their skills and capacities in design adaptation for their products and businesses in a new digital market. However, not many learning initiatives can be implemented in all of Sukhothai's 9 districts due to budgetary constraints. Moreover, it has become more difficult to organize creative-based economic activities in and around Sukhothai due to the COVID-19 pandemic. Therefore, a hybrid learning platform is a strategic approach: certain workshop and learning activities were adapted into both onsite and online events to ensure local crafts-makers access and to enable them to join such activities from remote areas. However, it is important to ensure each district can provide learning IOT (Internet of Things) to ensure that all interested people are able to participate.

SALMONI: Prolonged economic crises in Italy have disproportionately hit the crafts, creative and cultural sectors, making it difficult to engage meaningfully with entrepreneurs and build effective projects with the private sector.

BIAGINI: Through all the candidature processes in which we have participated, we have established clear rules for including all the different categories of creatives in the community and we have explicitly required that all entities supporting a candidature project set up two local committees:

- 1) A Strategic Committee that should focus on creating a four-year local development plan in the dossier that leverages the principal cultural asset(s) of the candidate city and guaranteeing that it becomes part of the city development plan; and
- 2) An Operational Committee that engages the local government, civil society, academia, non-profits and the creative community from the early phases of project development to share progress and receive feedbacks

and suggestions.

The objective is to engage and listen to all local stakeholders regardless of age, gender, religion affiliation and social and educational status, and to engage as many as possible external supporters that recognize the candidate city's cultural asset(s). Typically, the two committees merge into the organization that either has a consultative role with the city department that manages the nomination or becomes part of the Creative City Promotion Committee (a public-private collaborative organization) or an external cultural organization with full delegation of responsibility to manage the nomination. In the absence of the local committees described above, the candidature process, even if successful with UNESCO, might not be successful within its community and consequently may not generate enough momentum to organize and fund the (up to) six projects that are outlined in the dossier. The nomination is not effective when citizens (creatives or not) do not understand the real value of the obtained recognition and the potential long-term benefits to the community. Cities that have not used an approach like the one described above can still activate and engage the community after the nomination and detail the (up to) six projects with the contribution of newly set-up committees that coordinate with the organization managing the nomination.

B. Sustainable Development and Creative City

3. *What were the urgent challenges that your city hoped to solve by becoming a Creative City? Did your city's designation as a Creative City actually help to tackle such challenges?*

BIAGINI: Of the many cases analyzed, let me consider two that can represent a general trend within the UCCN:

1) Case 1: Carrara UCC Crafts and Folk Art (Italy, 2017)

Carrara has a 2000-year tradition in the excavation and transformation of marble, going back to Roman times. This unique local expertise in the artisanal and artistic transformation of marble into works of art has been declining over the years for lack of social recognition and economic sustainability of local creatives. The candidature and two of the signature activities implemented during the first four years since the UNESCO nomination have been addressing both challenges.

Project 1: “Hands at Work” is an online project managed by the city that calls on Carrara’s artists and artisans to describe how their work is the current expression of the *Genius Loci*. The project already has plans for a local, national and international phase.

Project 2: The bottom-up approach to formalize the “Declaration of Carrara on the Role of Artists and Artisans” as a driver of sustainable development of a community required the involvement of local government, civil society, academia, non-profits and the creative community to uncover the challenges faced by local creatives and discuss together the opportunities that the nomination offered to the community. The mid- to long-term results of the project have been summarized in six priorities that are passed on to the recently nominated new City Administration and included in their mid- to long-term planning. In this example, even if Carrara had not completely and thoroughly involved all the beneficiaries of the nomination while preparing the candidature dossier in 2017, it had a fully-immersive conversation with all the stakeholders and included their requests into the city’s mid- to long-term development plan.

2) Case 2: Bergamo UCC Gastronomy (Italy, 2019)

Bergamo and the Orobic Valleys’ 1000-year history of artisanal cheese making is not based on a mere mixture of ingredients and flavors but is a complex and splendid example of circular and sustainable economy, which favors the conservation of natural habitats and balances the relationship between an urban and a non-urban economy. Before the UCC nomination and the activation of local committees to investigate and address local challenges, all the members of the artisanal cheese value chain, from the shepherders to

the cheese makers, were not recognized as local treasures and the number of people dedicated to cheese production was dwindling by the year. The candidature process was an opportunity to reverse this negative trend and reevaluate the professionalism involved in the artisanal cheese making process, as well as to create a specialized Agricultural District (supported by the Central Government with specific financial resources) and transform the unique habitat to attract cultural tourism along the cheese value chain, stretching from the high mountain pastures of the Orobie Mountains to Bergamo Alta's historical city center. The city is promoting the achievements of the "Artisanal Cheese" project both locally and internationally. In this example, all the stakeholders from Bergamo were involved from the beginning and contributed to the definition of the six priorities of the city, thus resulting in a common project that benefits the city and its surroundings.

SALMONI: Italy has long incorporated urban regeneration policies with the two drivers of culture and environmental protection. This has prepared Italian Creative Cities to approach regeneration policies in a scalar, multi-linear way, using holistic approaches that are particularly suited for engagement with the wider UCCN community, and to make better use of the assets and contacts provided by UCCN.

JEONG: The rationale behind our city's aspiration to be a UNESCO Creative City is that there are three urgent challenges that it confronts. The first is the hollowing-out of the old city center. As public institutions move to newly developed innovation cities and new residential areas are built around the city, the old city center is becoming increasingly abandoned. Secondly, there is the problem of how to bridge the economic and cultural gaps between urban and rural areas. Lastly, with the belated onset of industrialization, the identity of Jinju as a historical and cultural city is being damaged.

Ever since Jinju joined the UCCN, citizens' cultural activities have grown remarkably and cultural organizations, as well as cultural events, have been increasing in number. We believe that these phenomena are greatly contributing to recovering the identity of Jinju as a historical and cultural

city. Nevertheless, we do expect this bridging of cultural gaps between urban and rural areas as well as the hollowing-out of the old city center to take a lot more time and effort.

4. *Creative city is defined as “a city that seeks to promote its sustainable development based on cultural assets and creativity.” It is widely acknowledged that becoming a Creative City helps promoting creative industries, fostering creative talents, producing a creative environment, enhancing international exchanges, and reducing inequalities. Which of these is the most important objective for your city, and do you think becoming a Creative City has contributed to achieving it?*

LOPPIES: Becoming a creative city has increased Ambon’s visibility at the local, national and international level for its rich musical culture which is a driving force for promoting community welfare and helping the government execute various socio-cultural, economic, environmental and educational agenda. The vision of the creative city of music as a tool for peace has been able to bind various social relations between races, ethnicities and religions to collaborate together and get rid of various gaps. Starting with the equality of arts and culture between communities, it has shown the power of the creative city of music to continue networking at the local, national and international levels. This is followed up through the involvement of music and non-music creative actors in 10 DTW music tours by recruiting musicians as music teachers with contract status in five elementary schools and five junior high schools and facilitating musicians at national and international virtual events. As a creative city, Ambon has implemented creativity and is able to: 1) analyze the creative economic potential of each sub-district based on the largest type of business in Ambon City starting from music, culinary arts and others; and 2) analyze the readiness of the Ambon City’s ecosystem starting from marketing (61.54%), financial

institutions (82.24%), product ideas (34.56%), certification (28.68%), scientific ventures (47.19%), assistance (63.94%), promotion (47.61%), training center (33.47%), research center and development center (35.72%). Ambon City leverages the networking with UCCN creative cities (295 cities as of 2022) at the national level, which helps several cities or districts in Indonesia become UCCN members. Internationally, UCCN has collaborated between creative music cities and across UCCN creative cities in exporting musicians and traditional music and providing input to other UCCN members.

PITTUNGNAPOO: Since becoming a member of UCCN in 2019, Sukhothai created and implemented the five-year Action Plan of Sukhothai UCCN for crafts and folk art (2021–2025) in line with its commitment to push the UCCN mission into practice. The most important aim of Sukhothai in joining UCCN is to promote its crafts and creative sector to drive the urban development mechanism in achieving SDGs (SDG 1: No Poverty; SDG 8: Decent Work and Economic Growth; SDG 9: Industry, Innovation and Infrastructure; SDG 10: Reduce Inequalities), particularly “SDG 11: Sustainable Cities and Communities” for a more sustainable future. Enhancement in private, public, people partnership is one of our crucial mechanisms to ensure everyone become engaged with the UCCN mission.

SALMONI: Through a holistic approach, Italian Creative Cities have thus far equilibrated these different creative drivers by building on integrated sustainable development. Creative policies have been mainstreamed in various sectors of administration: SDG 17, Partnership, was most widely affected by Fabriano’s partnership with UCCN. Membership and in particular, the 2019 UCCN Annual Conference, have allowed Fabriano to regain and further strengthen its international position after years of economic crisis.

C. Governance for the Implementation of the UCCN Programme and the Local Government

5. *Governance for the implementation of the UCCN programme can be formulated in various ways. Local governments may have a dedicated department to take full responsibility of the programme or consign it to an outside cultural organization. They may also establish a public-private collaborative body, such as the Creative City Promotion Committee. Please elaborate on your city's governance model for promoting the UCCN programme. What are some problems or difficulties that arise from the model, and how has your city addressed them?*

SALMONI: Fabriano has chosen a governance model based on public-private cooperation: day-to-day management of operations is tasked to external stakeholders such as private foundations, which manage the Focal Point position and organize a permanent office. The City Government drafts strategic guidelines and evaluates results. After a period of difficult coordination between the local and central governments, Fabriano is again working with great harmony and organizational capacity.

JEONG: Jinju has worked hard on the problem of how to establish governance for the implementation of the UCCN programmes. When it was designated as a Creative City, there was Creative City Team with two officers in charge of the programmes in the local government. A large part of the programmes were then consigned as part of government-subsidized project to a non-profit private organization, the Jinju Creative Industries Promotion Association. The policies and projects for the UCCN programmes were drawn up by the Creative City Steering Committee, a consultative body. However, this governance system faced many difficulties because a private organization can only receive funding for project costs, not for operational and personnel expenses from the local government. For this reason, when the Jinju Culture and Tourism Foundation was established in our city, the

Creative City Promotion Bureau was included as a part of the Foundation to be entrusted with most of UCCN programmes.

But two problems have arisen from this. First, the role of the Creative City Steering Committee comprising of the public and private sector has diminished while the private sector has played a large part in our UCCN programmes, which is the very strength of our city. Furthermore, after all the UCCN programmes were consigned to the Foundation, the local government abolished its Creative City Team along with its officers. The upshot is that the rigidity of the Foundation as a government-supervised institution has revealed itself to be inappropriate for the creativity and flexibility of the UCCN programmes. In addition, the cultural programmes undertaken by the Foundation have shown no difference from those of other local areas. Therefore, we have decided to take some of the UCCN programmes back again to the local government. The problem of governance is still a big pending issue for us.

BIAGINI: Let us address the question by reviewing the approach followed by Tucson UCC Gastronomy (USA, 2015).

Tucson based its candidature project on a complex anthropological and archeological thesis that the local gastronomy represents 3,500 years of continuous agricultural and human evolution in a semi-arid territory with the contribution of numerous immigrants that over the centuries and until now are making Tucson their new home. The city of Tucson was not organized to both prepare the dossier and manage the needs of the communities that are connected to this unique creative knowledge. Thus, the management of the nomination was immediately assigned to a dedicated ad-hoc non-profit organization that included members of the local government, civil society, academia, non-profits and representatives of many different creative communities that make up the unique gastronomy of Tucson (Tohono o'Odham nation and other local native Mexican, Chinese, and European people to name a few). The relationship between the non-profit and the city is very loose with little direct involvement of the city in the decision process. The result is that the non-profit has great latitude in setting goals and objectives on how to benefit the creative community, but little

direct support from the city to finance the proposed projects. To improve this relationship, there should be a set of qualitative and quantitative measurements of key performance indicators that allow both the city and the non-profit to communicate using terminology that eases reciprocal understanding and aligns missions and policies. Years since the nomination, the city is still not the primary source of funding for the non-profit and only few policy alignments have been achieved. The model used by Tucson UCC, while not perfect, is showing great potential to reach the best long-term results for the creatives, since it is not limited to one political vision that manages the city every five years and it is strengthened by a combination of stakeholders who are not pressured by just short-term results.

LOPPIES: The governance of the implementation of the UCCN programme in Ambon is carried out by the Ambon Music Office (AMO) which was formed by the Ambon city government to carry out various programmes and promote the UCCN programme. AMO is directly responsible to the Mayor of Ambon. The main task of AMO is to formulate strategies, implement music cities, build networks locally, nationally and internationally, and prepare documents for UNESCO's evaluation every four years. In carrying out its duties, AMO is based on 25 strategic steps related to music education, music community, music regulation and music business. Difficulties that greatly affect AMO's performance are budget execution and synergy with various regional apparatus organizations within the scope of the Ambon city government because not all of them focus on the development of creative cities as their ultimate goal. Musical creativity is still not considered as an important factor in increasing regional income. The commitment to carry out movements in the city is still not oriented towards musical creativity as a creative economic force that promotes the welfare of urban communities. Moving forward, AMO should include the UCCN programme in the Ambon City's long-term work plan. It also carries out collaborations with the central government (the ministry of tourism and creative economy; the ministries of education, culture, research and technology), the Indonesia Creative Cities Network (ICCN) and UCCN members internationally.

D. Citizen Participation and Promotion

6. *In a creative city, participation by the citizens, along with the city's cultural assets, is considered to be a crucial factor in promoting the UCCN programme. In order to encourage their participation, the programme's main contents and outcomes should be reported and feedbacked to the citizens. In your city, do you find that the citizens' interest and participation in the programme are at a satisfactory level? If not, what do you think are the main causes and what measures can be implemented to address them?*

JEONG: As mentioned before, how to attract people's participation is one of the biggest problems. The level of citizens' interest and participation in UCCN programmes is not satisfactory at all. The dissemination of folk dances which we have carried out as part of the UCCN programmes for the past four years has somewhat gained its footing. About 1,000 citizens learn the Jinju traditional dances a year. These citizens, at the very least, are aware of Jinju as a Creative City and uphold and enjoy cultural assets in daily life. However, participation was insufficient in the Traditional Crafts Biennale and the World Folk Arts Biennale held this and last year. We can point to insufficient publicity as the main reason for that. Fundamentally, however, the idea of pursuing sustainable development of the city through culture and creativity does not seem to be firmly entrenched in people's minds. We want to learn from cases of other creative cities that have had more success.

SALMONI: Fabriano reached its highest citizen participation in its path to the 2019 Annual Conference, which was organized through many public meetings, open competitions and associations' proposals for events and themes. Although there was less active involvement since the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic, it is again on the rise thanks to the Creative City's direct involvement in post-earthquake reconstruction. Both on- and offline communication will be improved to better raise awareness on UCCN policies

and opportunities.

LOPPIES: Community interest and participation is quite high. This successful participation is possible because the people of Ambon City are already culturally inclined to making music and singing. However, meeting the needs of the community is very dependent on having a sufficient budget to mobilize community participation. Therefore, the strategy is to change the community's mindset to consider music as not only a natural ability but also something more methodological and professional that has an impact on improving the community's economy. The local compulsory music curriculum programme in 10 pilot project schools aims to strengthen community participation for better community welfare. The impact is the creation of Creative Capital involving the participation of the local creative community including children and parents of all genders: 5,300 non-musical creative economy actors, 133 singers, 36 guitar players, 56 keyboard players, 29 bass players, 15 drum players, 4 saxophone players, 6 arrangers, 55 composers, 45 rappers and 100 Hip-Hop groups. There are 780 choirs, 17 Hawaiian bands, 45 bands, 23 *sawat/hadrat* groups, 1 bamboo-wind orchestra, 15 *totobuang* groups, 1 violin ensemble, 49 studios, and 80 Brass Bands and 120 Academics. Creative Capital increased by 46.26 percent. Construction of a Creative Arena in the form of 1 International Pro Recording Studio on the UNPATTI campus; 8 medium studios and 25 home studios that produce a total of 850 regional pop songs nationally; 1 Ethnic Music Performance room on the IAIN Campus. Creative Spaces that are directly related to musicians and the community have increased by 60.47 percent.

E. Creative Cities Network and International Exchange

7. *Cities join the UNESCO Creative City Network to share their knowledge, experiences, and practices with other creative cities in the same sub-network. Do you think that becoming a member of the UCCN has contributed to promoting international exchange and sharing knowledge and experiences as expected? If not, what do you think are the main causes?*

PITTUNGNAPOO: As a member of UCCN for crafts and folk art, Sukhothai has had the great opportunity to learn and share good practices in integrating SDGs into urban development through the creative sector. Moreover, there are certain initiatives to support Sukhothai in achieving the UCCN mission as stated in its application. Additionally, participating in the review of monitoring reports from other sub-network members of the UCCN for crafts and folk art has provided insightful experiences in learning how each city has worked on its own creative area across other creative fields to contribute to the achievement of the SDGs. Importantly, a creation of international collaboration either as knowledge and research or technical and innovation is transferred to enhance capacity-building among creative cities is expected contribution from being the member of UCCN in a more sustainable future.

SALMONI: Fabriano has reached important international cooperation milestones thanks to UCCN. After a difficult period of isolation due to the 2009 economic crisis, UCCN has allowed Fabriano to build strong contacts, owing also to prolonged engagement with intra- and inter-cluster initiatives reaching its peak in the 2019 Annual Conference. UCCN has also led better to capacity-building, joint projects, and scientific research. Italian Creative Cities are joined in a network which was established two years ago and is currently coordinated by Fabriano as a focal point for meetings and exchanging contacts, solutions, and best practices as well as an interlocutor

for the National Commission, which has appreciated the existence of such an organization.

JEONG: As one of the UCCN programmes, our city has published the *International Journal of Crafts and Folk Arts* (IJCF) since 2020. In the 14th UCCN Annual Conference held in Santos, Brazil in 2022, the Journal received much attention from the Sub-network of Crafts and Folk Art and was introduced to the UCCN meeting. The objective of the Journal is to share knowledge, experiences and practices among the UCCN member cities, many of which have actively participated. We hope that this Journal will serve as a medium for exchanges and cooperation among our sub-network members and, further, between and among other creative fields. We positively review our projects like the 2022 World Folk Arts Biennale and the Artist-in-Residence. Seven UCCN member cities participated in the Biennale and artists from three cities were invited according to the latter project. If Jinju had not joined the UCCN, these international programmes would not be possible at such a level. We believe that not only Jinju's residents, but artists of the UCCN member cities as well realized cultural diversity as the foundation of creativity.

F. Difficulties in Specifying a Creative Field and Collaborating with Other Institutions

8. *Each creative city has a membership to a sub-network of the UCCN. In other words, each city is based on a particular creative field. Please share your views on whether the chosen creative field becomes an obstacle to a balanced development alongside other creative fields within your city or exchanges with creative cities in other fields?*

SALMONI: No, the Crafts and Folk Art Cluster has the most members and is also very proactive. It has also experimented with governance innovation and projects that can be of inspiration for a wider reorganization of UCCN.

JEONG: The very theme of the UCCN Crafts and Folk Art Sub-network Annual Meeting held in Jinju this year was “Convergence and Collaboration between Creative Fields.” The conclusions of the XIV UCCN Annual Conference in Santos also emphasized the need “to reinforce its endeavors to seek opportunities for intersectoral and crosscutting collaboration through events, exchange projects and joint initiatives across different creative fields.” While admitting that we were able to join the UCCN sub-network thanks to the many cultural assets which we have in the field of crafts and folk art, it would leave much to be desired if we pursued development in this field only. In order to develop the field of crafts and folk art itself, we have to exchange and collaborate with creative cities of other fields including music, film, literature, design, gastronomy and media arts. Emphasizing just a specific field would in fact inhibit its development. Unfortunately, however, the reality is that such exchanges rarely happen. In this respect, we are convinced that the role of the National Commission for UNESCO in each Member State and the UCCN Secretariat should be strengthened in the future. In particular, we would like to request further strengthening mutual introductions and linking programmes of various creative cities. In addition, we hope that best practices of collaboration and convergence will

be presented in upcoming UCCN annual meetings.

PITTUNGNAPOO: Having experience in coaching cities in Thailand (Sukhothai UCCN 2019, Phetchaburi UCCN 2021, and Nan) to choose concerned creative fields before applying to be UCCN members has provided me with insights on appropriate decision-making. There are certain criteria which may be helpful for other cities to consider in achieving mutual agreements which are:

Phase 1: Before selecting the concerned creative field, each city may be faced with a dilemma for decision-making concerning the creative area it should go for. I suggest looking both backward and forward. The former concerns its own cultural context and whether the selected creative field is unique enough to make the city different from others. The latter is to see whether the selected creative field can broaden the city's potential to achieve its targeted development goals.

Phase 2: During the review process after the creative field was selected, it is important to understand that each city has different priorities to tackle based on each targeted development goal. Therefore, further discussion across the public and private partners is a crucial process in ensuring that the selected creative field will be promoted and employed as a key UCCN urban mechanism to address the city's problems and future challenges. Significantly, the expected contributions of the selected creative area of development should generate a high impact on a great number of people rather than benefits for a limited group of residents.

Phase 3: After selecting a particular creative field, to avoid any misperceptions, to achieve participation from all and to ensure no ones will be left behind, it is important to communicate with the public and stakeholders to understand how the city will work on the selected creative fields along with another six creative fields. This does not mean only the selected creative fields will be promoted; but the city will also, where necessary, support creativity across other creative fields in order to achieve its targeted sustainable goals.

9. *Please describe how your city's educational institutions, arts and cultural organizations, and the media participate in the UCCN programme. If you think that the linkage and cooperation among these organizations is insufficient, what are the causes and what measures can be implemented to address them?*

BIAGINI: I want to address this question by analyzing two completely different clusters: Crafts and Folk Art (Carrara) and Gastronomy (Tucson), firstly in Italy where educational institutions are mainly regulated, funded, and have programming set by the central government with a strong focus on “academic knowledge,” and secondly the case of the USA where government regulation, financing and programming are often adapted and supplemented by foundations that are dedicated to support specific local needs of “practical knowledge.”

1) Case 1: Central Government's Strong Involvement in Education

The creative community of Carrara has clearly identified in the Carrara Declaration changes that they perceive are necessary to establish profitable collaboration with local educational institutions, but the central government's control over curricula leave little room for specialized training needed by local artisans and even the industrial sector. Even the two specialized technical public schools in the area can dedicate only a small percentage of their time to the unique practical skills that are needed to train the next generation of local artists/artisans, therefore the new graduates cannot find immediate employment in the local enterprises. The local *Accademia di Belle Arti* (a university equivalent art school) offers highly specialized courses for which the basic knowledge acquired at the local technical schools is not a sufficient preparatory training, so very few students continue their education training after the technical school and search instead immediately a low paying local job. The result is a dysfunctional educational system that does not help in transferring local knowledge to the next generation and a complex, long and often unpaid apprenticeship period is required to keep

the local creative knowledge alive, thus discouraging the new generations from pursuing career opportunities in the stonework sector. The community consultation, whose recommendations are summarized in the Declaration of Carrara, gave indications on how to address and possibly resolve this issue and the city is recently starting to act on the recommendations. In Carrara, a small town of approximately 35,000 people, local media has a limited impact on national and international audiences, so they do not constitute an important source of collaboration. Only large corporations, rarely local artists/artisans, attract the attention of national/international media. Other cultural organizations like local foundations provide great support both by creating grant opportunities for individual creatives and by financing local events and fairs. Recently, the City Manager has established rules for continuous collaboration and consulting that paved the way to defining a common vision between the objective of the local foundations and that of the creative city.

2) Case 2: Foundation's Strong Involvement in Education

The creative community of Tucson (that is, farmers, ranchers, gatherers, all the way to food transformers and chefs) receive a more focused education than the creative people from Carrara. In the USA as opposed to what happens in Italy, technical school curricula are geared toward practical learning and can be adapted to specific needs (e.g., arid land environment) with the support of funding provided by local foundations/donors, interaction between technical schools, colleges and universities that give students a sufficient knowledge base to start working in the local market immediately after they finish their academic education cycle. Low wages associated with the jobs along the gastronomy value chain might be the only negative impact on keeping the local knowledge transferred to the new generations, rather than a lack of immediate paid job opportunities. In Tucson the local media suffers of the same limitation of Carrara's local media, but specialized local blogs/publications are more vigilant on local events and the creative community, creating awareness within the community. Also, the local tourism office is dedicated to attracting the attention of national and international media, including film/documentary

producers to document and promote the unique local gastronomy scene. The nomination has been a windfall for Tucson's tourism office budget: since it happened there is less need to acquire paid advertising space and many media outlets are giving free space to Tucson to talk about events happening in this first UNESCO Creative City of Gastronomy in the USA. The above are the fruits of a wise organization of the non-profit entity that manages the nomination, which requires that the board of directors select its members from local education entities, the local tourism office and local non-profits well aware of the needs of the community.

SALMONI: Since their close involvement in the 2019 UCCN Annual Conference, local cultural associations have increasingly engaged with the Creative City projects. This participation is even shared with micro-associations and micro-projects.